



August 29, 2023

*Via ECF*

Orrick, Herrington & Sutcliffe LLP  
51 West 52nd Street  
New York, NY 10019-6142  
+1 212 506 5000  
[orrick.com](http://orrick.com)

The Honorable Lewis A. Kaplan  
United States District Court  
Southern District of New York  
Daniel Patrick Moynihan U.S. Courthouse  
500 Pearl Street  
New York, NY 10007

**Marc R. Shapiro**  
**E** [mrshapiro@orrick.com](mailto:mrshapiro@orrick.com)  
**D** +1 212 506 3546  
**F** +1 212 506 5151

**Re: *Jentz v. TIAA*, No. 23-cv-6944; *Lopez v. TIAA*, No. 23-cv-6956**

Dear Judge Kaplan:

Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 42(a), Defendant Teachers Insurance and Annuity Association of America (“TIAA”), together with Named Plaintiffs consistent with the attached stipulation, hereby move this Court to consolidate two recently filed—and related—cases for all purposes.

Under Rule 42(a), a court may consolidate actions when they involve “a common question of law or fact.” Fed. R. Civ. P. 42. Rule 42 is a tool “invoked to expedite trial and eliminate unnecessary repetition and confusion, and it vests a district court with broad discretion to consolidate actions[.]” *Marcaurel v. USA Waste-Management Resources, LLC*, 2021 WL 4940977 at \*1 (S.D.N.Y. Sept. 3, 2021). A determination on whether to consolidate actions “involves weighing considerations of convenience, judicial economy, and cost reduction while ensuring that the ‘paramount concern for a fair and impartial trial’ is honored.” *Combs v. Warner Music Group*, 2020 WL 8642133 at \*1 (S.D.N.Y. Nov. 10, 2020) (quoting *Johnson v. Celotex Corp.*, 899 F.2d 1281, 1284-85 (2d Cir. 1990)). “Considerations of judicial economy strongly favor simultaneous resolution of all claims growing out of one event.” *Bank of Montreal v. Eagle Assocs.*, 117 F.R.D. 530, 532 (S.D.N.Y. 1987) (internal quotations omitted).

Five class action complaints have been filed against TIAA in the Southern District of New York, each of which seeks to hold TIAA responsible for an alleged data breach on or around May 29-30, 2023 involving Progress Software Corp. Inc.’s MOVEit transfer software. Plaintiffs in two cases—Andre Lopez and Gayle Jentz—have served their complaints, which were identified as



The Honorable Lewis A. Kaplan

August 29, 2023

Page 2

related on August 25, 2023. Each of the cases arises from the same event, involves alleged exposure of personal information maintained by TIAA, solely names TIAA as a defendant, and asserts similar theories of Named Plaintiffs' and putative class members' entitlement to relief. The parties believe that consolidating *Jentz* and *Lopez* will serve the interests of convenience, judicial economy, and cost reduction, and will not risk prejudice to any party. In particular, consolidation will allow for coordinated motion and discovery practice as well as trial proceedings.

This Court has previously consolidated cases arising out of the same data breach. In *USA Waste Management Resources*, the Court consolidated several cases that “assert[ed] causes of action arising from a data breach of WM’s computer systems that allegedly occurred between January 21 and 23, 2021[.]” 2021 WL 4940977 at \*1 (internal quotations omitted). And, in *Warner Music Group*, the Court consolidated “nine cases [that] ar[o]se from the data breach that Warner Music Group announced in early September 2020.” 2020 WL 8642133 at \*1. Just as this Court found in *USA Waste Management Resources* and *Warner Music Group*, here, “consolidation is plainly warranted.” *USA Waste-Management Resources, LLC*, 2021 WL 4940977 at \*2; *Warner Music Group*, 2020 WL 8642133 at \*2.

The parties have also conferred regarding the other three cases—*King v. TIAA*, Case No. 23-cv-7407; *Smuda v. TIAA*, Case No. 23-cv-7020; *Anderson v. TIAA*, Case No. 23-cv-7437—and agree those matters should also be consolidated. As such, TIAA will waive service and file notices of related case in each of those three actions. Once those cases are reassigned to the same judge as *Lopez* and *Jentz*, the parties request that they be consolidated with *Lopez* and *Jentz* for the same reasons set forth herein.

The parties propose that, within 14 days of consolidation of all five cases, the parties will file with the Court a case schedule that sets forth deadlines for an amended, consolidated complaint, TIAA’s responsive pleading, and appointment of interim lead class counsel.

A Stipulation and Proposed Order memorializing the parties’ proposed plan for consolidation and subsequent filings is attached. The parties are available to discuss this proposal if helpful to the Court.



The Honorable Lewis A. Kaplan  
August 29, 2023  
Page 3

Respectfully submitted,

Marc R. Shapiro

Cc: All Counsel of Record